Survey Findings

Shelter, safety, and feelings of security within the Negev Bedouin society in the shadow of the war between Israel and Hamas

Dr. Manal Hreib, Dr. Yulia Shevchenko and Doron Bruitman

Against the background of the war that broke out between Israel and Hamas on October 7, 2023, the Bedouin Society Knowledge Hub conducted a survey focused on the safety and sense of security of the residents in both the recognized Bedouin villages (63.7% of the survey respondents) and the unrecognized villages (26.3% of the survey respondents) in the Negev.

The survey was conducted in an online format between the dates 16-25.11.2023. The number of respondents to the survey is 350. Of these: 46.3% are from planned towns (a total of 162 respondents), 36.3% from unrecognized villages (a total of 127 respondents) and 17.4% from regional councils (recognized villages in the Neve Midbar and Al Kasum regional councils - a total of 61 respondents). Of all the respondents, 66.5% work outside the home (employed and self-employed) and 23.5% are unemployed.

As the survey was conducted on an online platform, it can be assumed that those who responded to it have digital literacy skills and therefore, as expected, the rates of educated respondents and those participating in the labor market, is higher than their share in the population. Therefore, the survey data were analyzed based on the segmentation of the various groups with reference to educational levels, type of geographic settlement (planned towns, regional councils, unrecognized villages), and employment.

The segmentation of respondents to the survey based on years of education is: 21.4% have a master’s degree, 32.3% have a bachelor’s degree (that is, 53.7% of all respondents have an academic education). 3.4% have a professional certificate, 28.6% have a secondary education, and the education of 14.3% is less than 12 years of schooling.

By gender segmentation: 69.1% (242) women and 30.9% (108) men responded to the survey.

The average age of the respondents to the survey is 35.

The goal of the survey was to investigate various aspects of the safety and the sense of security of the residents of Bedouin communities in the Negev in light of the events of October 7, their aftermath, and the war that broke out between Israel and Hamas. The survey examines the aspects of safety and security in regard to several indicators: economic, occupational, social and spatial.

It should be noted that while there are “red alerts” (by way of Home Front warning sirens) during rocket fire in the planned towns and in most of the regional councils, in the unrecognized villages, due to their definition, there are no such alerts during rocket fire and they are often defined as open areas (and as such are not protected by the Iron Dome defense systems).

Missile strike in an unrecognized village, Oct. 9, 2023
Summary of the findings:

**Shelter:**

67.6% of the population does not have access to any protected space. 92% of the residents of the unrecognized villages reported that they could not reach a protected space in time to avoid possible injury during rocket fire.

Out of all the respondents, 67.7% reported that they were unable to reach a protected space in time. 28.3% answered that they could reach a safe place, and the rest (4%) did not know how to answer the question. Segmented in regard to the type of living community: 92% of those living in unrecognized villages replied that they cannot reach a protected space in time to avoid possible injury. 82% of those living in the regional councils replied that they could not reach a safe space, and 43% of the respondents living in the planned towns replied that they cannot reach a protected space in time.

The most common form of protective structures in the various types of geographic settlements: in the planned towns: bomb proof rooms ("mamad" in Hebrew, hereinafter MMD), 52%; in the regional councils: MMD (9.8%) and stairwells (9.8%), and in the unrecognized villages: concrete cylinders (4%).

In accordance with the latest studies regarding protective structures in the Bedouin settlements in the Negev (Knesset Research and Information Center, 2023), the survey indicates high levels of distress among the residents of the regional councils and even more severe distress among the residents in the unrecognized villages. Out of all the respondents who live in planned towns, 17.4% stated that the protected space that they rely on during red alerts are stairwells, 52% have MMDs and 2% go to public shelters.

In contrast to them, only 10% of the residents of the Neve Midbar and Al-Kasom regional councils have MMDs, another 10% make use of stairwells, and only 1.6% go to public shelters. Among the residents of the unrecognized villages, the situation is even worse, as the data shows: only 2.4% answered that they have access to a public shelter. 4% shelter in concrete cylinders that have been placed in several areas, and another 1.6% in Hesco barrier shelters. For all the others, there is no access to protected spaces at all.
Segmentation according to education, shows that there is a correlation between the level of education of the respondents and their ability to reach a protected area: 86% of those with less than 12 years of schooling answered that they are unable to reach a protected area, while 77% of those with a secondary school education and 75% of those with technical job training, answered similarly. 64% of those with a bachelor’s degree responded that they were unable to reach a protected space, while 48% of those with a master’s degree responded similarly. The survey data also indicate a possible connection between the level of education of the respondents and the type of accessible protected space. 29.5% of the respondents with a bachelor’s degree and 49% with a master’s degree answered that they evacuate to an MMD during a red alert, while only 8.15% of those with less than 12 years of education, 18% of those with a high school education, and 16.5% of those with technical job training answered similarly. Regarding the distance of the most accessible protected space: 32.5% of respondents with a bachelor’s degree and 47% with a master’s degree have access to a protected space within 200 meters of their home, while only 8.3% of those with technical diplomas, and 19% of those with secondary school education answered similarly. Respondents with less than 12 years of schooling have no access at all to a protected space within 200 meters of their home.

**Economic consequences following the war:**

22.75% of the respondents reported negative effects on their income from work. A comparison between academics and non-academics shows that those with a non-academic education (high school and below and technical training) were more affected (26.8%) compared to academics (21.5%). This aspect is examined in the segmentation of those who are in the workforce (not including the unemployed and housewives). 15.5% of all respondents who are in the labor market reported that they lost their source of income. Another 6.5% were put on unpaid leave, and 0.86% were fired from their jobs. Segmented according to education levels, 27.6% of respondents with a non-academic education lost a source of income following the war. High rates of source of income loss were also reported among those with higher education. Among bachelor’s and master’s degree holders, this rate stands at 21.5%. In addition, holders of a bachelor’s and master’s degree were the only groups of respondents who reported being laid off in the shadow of the war: about 1% of those with a bachelor’s degree and about 1.5% of those with a master’s degree reported being laid off during the war.
31.15% of the residents of unrecognized villages reported that their income from work was negatively affected by the war.

Segmented by type of living community, 19.6% of the residents of unrecognized villages, 16.6% of the residents of planned towns, and 5% of residents of the regional councils reported the loss of a source of income. The residents of unrecognized villages were the only ones who reported being laid off during the war (3.5%). Regarding unpaid leave, the residents of the regional councils reported the highest rates of unpaid leave (10%), followed by the residents of unrecognized villages (8.2%), and the residents of planned towns (4.5%).

On a whole, the income from work of residents of the unrecognized villages was affected to the greatest degree (31.5%). For those in the planned towns, the rate stands at 21.2%, followed by the residents of regional councils (15%).

![Loss of source of income as a result of the war as per type of geographic settlement](image)

Approximately 70% of all respondents reported an undermining of their sense of economic security as a result of the war. The residents of the unrecognized villages reported the highest rates of loss to their sense of economic security (about 71%).

68.28% of all respondents reported an erosion of their sense of economic security following the war. 70% of all respondents reported a fear of losing their livelihood following the war.

71.67% of the residents of the unrecognized villages replied that their economic security was damaged to a moderate or great extent because of the war, followed by the residents of the planned towns (68%), and the residents of the regional councils (64.1%).

![Undermining of sense of security as a result of the war](image)
Sense of security:

80% of the residents of the unrecognized villages reported that they are very much afraid of a direct hit by a missile at their place of residence, compared to 73% of the residents of the regional councils, and 62% of the residents of the planned towns.

The residents of the unrecognized villages reported the highest rates of fear of physical harm due to rocket fire. 71% of the residents of the unrecognized villages indicated that they are very much afraid of bodily harm from missiles, while 62% of the residents of the regional councils and 50.5% of the residents of the planned towns responded similarly. Accordingly, 80% of the residents of the unrecognized villages reported that they are greatly afraid of a direct hit by a missile at their place of residence, compared to 73% of the residents of the regional councils, and 62% of the residents of the planned towns. This trend continues with reference to the respondents’ perception of threats to their lives and to the lives of their family members from missiles. 77% of the residents of the unrecognized villages reported that they are greatly afraid of harm to their lives or the lives of their families from missiles, while these rates stood at 73% among the residents of the regional councils, and 61.5% among the residents of the planned towns.

There is a positive correlation between the sense of security and education, so that the lower the level of education, the weaker the sense of security, which is directly related to low accessibility to a protected space.

The highest rates of fear of physical harm as the result of rocket fire were reported among the respondents who have less than 12 years of schooling. 72% of the respondents whose education is less than 12 years of schooling reported that they are very much afraid of bodily harm due to missiles, while 65% of those with a high school education, 56% with a bachelor’s degree, 55% with a master’s degree, and 41.5% with professional training replied in a similar way. Accordingly, 85% of the respondents who have less than 12 years of education are very afraid of a missile falling directly on their place of residence, followed by those with a high school education (75%), those with professional training (75%), those with a master’s degree (65%) and a bachelor’s degree (63%). With regard to fear of harm to the respondents’ lives or the lives of their family members as a result of falling missiles, 85% of those with less than 12 years of schooling reported fear to a great extent. 83% of those with professional training, 71.5% with high school education, 65% with a bachelor’s degree, and 59.5% with a master’s degree, responded that they have a great fear that their lives or the lives of their family members may be harmed as a result of the missiles being fired at the Negev settlements.
Great fear of physical harm from missiles at place of residence as per level of education

Great fear of personal physical harm as per level of education
Sense of security in social space:

43.5% of the respondents reported that they did not feel safe at all to enter cities such as Beer Sheva during the war.

Regarding sense of security in the social space, three aspects were examined: the feeling of security in the public space in the respondent’s own residential area, the feeling of security when leaving that residential area, and the feeling of security in mixed or Jewish cities.

Of all the respondents, 16.7% stated that they feel safe walking around in their own residential area, 42.3% stated that they feel moderately safe, and 41% answered that they do not feel safe walking around in their own residential area at all. Regarding going outside the residential area, the sense of lack of security is similar, with 41.5% that do not feel safe leaving their residential area, 36.5% who reported that they feel moderately safe to leave their place of residence, and 22% who reported that they feel very safe to leave their area of residence. This trend moderates in relation to the departure from the residential area to cities such as Beer Sheva. 43.5% reported that they did not feel safe at all to go to such cities during the war, 38% reported that they felt moderately safe, and 18.5% reported that they felt safe to a great extent.

Racism

All respondents expressed fear of expressions of racism in light of the war. 56% stated that they have a great fear of expressions of racism, 47% stated that they fear expressions of racism and harassment in the workplace to a great extent, 52% reported that they fear racism and persecution by officials.
84% of the women expressed concerns about harassment in the workplace, and 81% of women expressed concerns about racism and persecution by officials.

In segmentation by gender, the rate of women who reported a moderate or great fear of expressions of racism in all parameters were higher as compared to men. Among women, 86.5% reported concerns about expressions of general racism, compared to 79.5% among men. 84% of women expressed concerns about harassment in the workplace, compared to 67% of the men. Finally, 81% of women expressed fears of racism and persecution by officials, compared to 71.5% of men with those same fears. This finding can be explained by the greater visibility of religious Muslim women in the public sphere marked by traditional clothing, while some men may be able to “pass” in the public sphere.

**In conclusion:**

The findings of the survey indicate a significant influence on the safety and sense of security of the Bedouin society in the Negev in all the parameters examined. The consequences of the war exacerbate the depth of the distress of the Bedouin society in the Negev, a society characterized by economic and occupational vulnerability. For years, the Bedouin communities in the Negev have been at the top of the national list of communities in terms of suffering from poverty, unemployment, and lack of housing, as well as at the top of the national list of home demolitions, school dropouts, and lack of classrooms and educational institutions. To add to these problems, as a result of a long-standing policy characterized by the neglect of the unique needs and hardships of this population, there is very little protection from missiles, and an almost complete absence of shelters, in the unrecognized villages. At the same time, the Bedouin society in the Negev is not homogenous, as the data indicates a significant and deeper harm to the most weakened groups in the society - the residents of the unrecognized villages and those with non-academic education. In this light, we find that the crisis that intensified when the war between Israel and Hamas started, has led to a deepening of the plight of the most weakened marginal groups in the Bedouin society in the Negev, as well as in Israeli society as a whole.

**For more information:** office@dukium.org

In accordance with the law, the Negev Coexistence Forum for Civil Equality is proud to note that as a result of cooperation with friendly countries and international organizations that promote human rights, most of the funding for our activities comes from “foreign entities.”

Our use of photographs is in accordance with Section 27A of the Copyright Law 2007. If you believe that your right as a copyright owner has been violated in the material appearing in this publication, you may contact us via e-mail at: office@dukium.org